

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF THE
SECOND JUDICIAL CIRCUIT, IN AND
FOR LEON COUNTY, FLORIDA,

CHRISTINE JENNINGS, nominee of the
Democratic Party for Representative in
Congress from the State of Florida's
Thirteenth Congressional District,

Plaintiff,

vs

CASE NO. 2006-CA-2973

ELECTIONS CANVASSING COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF FLORIDA; SARASOTA
COUNTY CANVASSING BOARD; KATHY
DENT, as Sarasota County Supervisor of
Elections; SUE M. COBB, as Secretary of State
of the State of Florida; DAWN K. ROBERTS,
as Director of the Division of Elections of the
State of Florida; VERN BUCHANAN, as
nominee of the Republican Party for
Representative in Congress from the State of
Florida's Thirteenth Congressional District;
and ELECTION SYSTEMS & SOFTWARE, INC.,

Defendants.

ELLEN FEDDER, LANCE JONES, ERNEST LASCHE,
a/k/a MIKE LASCHE, BARBARA KLEIN, LOIS
HARMES, JOHN MINDER, DOVIE MURRAY,
JOHN McBRIDE, SUSAN GAAR, GARY LAMER
and CHARLES CLIFTON,

Plaintiffs,

CASE NO. 2006-CA-2996

FILED
CIRCUIT JUDGE DINA
09 DEC 29 PM 12:12
DEPT. HAZELTON
CLERK CIRCUIT COURT
LEON COUNTY, FLORIDA



vs

TOM GALLAGHER, Chief Financial Officer, State of Florida, GOVERNOR JEB BUSH, and State Senator DAN WEBSTER, as members of and as the FLORIDA ELECTIONS CANVASSING COMMISSION; and SUE M. COBB, as Secretary of State, State of Florida; et al.,

Defendants.

ORDER ON MOTIONS

This cause came on for hearing on the Motions To Compel filed by Plaintiff, Christine Jennings, and Plaintiffs, Ellen Fedder, Lance Jones, Ernest Lasche, a/k/a Mike Lasche, Barbara Klein, Lois Harmes, John Minder, Dovie Murray, John McBride, Susan Gaar, Gary Lamer, and Charles Clifton, and the Motion For Entry of a Protective Order filed by Plaintiff, Christine Jennings. The Court having considered the evidence presented, the record, argument of counsel, and being otherwise fully advised finds as follows:

A. All parties agree for the purposes of the motions that the Source Code and Proprietary Technology associated therewith constitutes a trade secret.

B. The sole issue for determination is whether or not Plaintiffs can demonstrate a reasonable necessity to gain access to the trade secret.

C. Plaintiffs allege that there was some 18,412 undervotes in the race for The United States House of Representatives in Florida's Thirteenth Congressional District in Sarasota County, or 12.9% of the votes cast in said county, and that such a large number

demonstrates a malfunctioning of the iVotronic system which rejected thousands of legal votes.

D. The machines now challenged were tested as required by law prior to the early voting and election day voting and were found to be working properly.

E. Because the election was a close one and due to Plaintiffs' allegations an audit was conducted on the voting system to verify its accuracy.

F. Two parallel tests were conducted on the subject screen systems and representatives of both Plaintiffs and Defendants were present. The test results revealed 100% accuracy of the equipment in reporting the vote selections.

G. Plaintiffs have presented no evidence to demonstrate that the parallel testing was flawed and/or the results not valid.

H. The testimony of Plaintiffs' experts was nothing more than conjecture and not supported by credible evidence.


I. For this Court to grant Plaintiffs' motions would require this Court to find that it is reasonably necessary for the Plaintiffs to have access to the trade secrets of Defendant, Election Systems & Software, Inc., based on nothing more than speculation and conjecture, and would result in destroying or at least gutting the protections afforded those who own the trade secrets.

Accordingly, it is

ORDERED AND ADJUDGED as follows:

1. The Motion To Compel filed by Plaintiff, Christine Jennings, is Denied.
2. The Motion To Compel filed by Plaintiffs, Ellen Fedder, Lance Jones, Ernest Lasche, a/k/a Mike Lasche, Barbra Klein, Lois Harmes, John Minder, Dovie Murray, John McBride, Susan Gaar, Gary Lamer, and Charles Clifton, is Denied.
3. The Motion For Entry of a Protective Order filed by Plaintiff, Christine Jennings, is moot, and thus Denied.

DONE AND ORDERED in Chambers at Tallahassee, Leon County, Florida, this 29th day of December, 2006.



WILLIAM L. GARY
Circuit Judge

copies to:

KENDALL COFFEY
Coffey & Wright, LLP
2665 South Bayshore Drive
PH-2, Grand Bay Plaza
Miami, FL 33133
fax: 305.859.9919
and
MARK HERRON
Messer, Caparello & Self, PA
2618 Centennial Place
Tallahassee, FL 32308
fax: 850.558.0659
and
DONALD B. VERRILLI, JR.
SAM HIRSCH
JESSICA RING AMUNSON

Jenner & Block, LLP
601 13th Street NW
Suite 1200 South
Washington, DC 20005
fax: 202.639.6066
Attorneys for Plaintiff/Jennings

PETER ANTONACCI
ALLEN C. WINSOR
GrayRobinson, PA
301 South Bronough Street, Suite 600
P.O. Box 11189
Tallahassee, FL 32302
fax: 850.577.3311
Attorneys for State Defendants

REGINALD J. MITCHELL
People for the American Way Foundation
1550 Melvin Street
Tallahassee, FL 32301
fax: 850.402.1999
Attorney for Fedder Plaintiffs

LOWELL FINLEY
Voter Action
1604 Solano Avenue
Berkeley, CA 94707
fax: 415.723.7141
Attorney for Fedder Plaintiffs

RONALD A. LABASKY
Young Van Assenderp, PA
225 South Adams Street
Tallahassee, FL 32302
fax: 850.561.6834
Attorneys for Defendant, Supervisor Kathy Dent

FREDERICK J. ELBRECHT
Sarasota County Attorney's Office
1660 Ringling Blvd., Floor 2
Sarasota, FL 34236-6870
fax: 941.861.7267
Attorney for Defendant, Sarasota County Canvassing Board

MIGUEL DeGRANDY, PA
800 S. Douglas Road, Suite 850
Coral Gables, FL 33134-2088
fax: 305.443.2616
Attorney for Defendant, ES& S

HARRY O. THOMAS
Radey Thomas Yon & Clark,
P.O. Box 10967
Tallahassee, FL 32302-2967
fax: 850.425.6694
Attorneys for Defendant, ES & S

ELLIOT M. MINCBERG
JUDITH E. SCHAEFFER
People for the American Way Foundation
2000 M Street NW, #400
Washington, DC 20036
fax: 202.293.2672
Attorneys for Fedder Plaintiffs

MUSLIMA LEWIS
RANDALL C. MARSHALL
AZIZA NAA-KAA BOTCHWAY
ACLU Foundation of Florida, Inc.
4500 Biscayne Boulevard, Suite 340
Miami, FL 33137-3227
fax: 786.363.1448

CINDY A. COHN
MATTHEW J. ZIMMERMAN
Electronic Frontier Foundation
454 Shotwell Street

San Francisco, CA 94110
fax: 415.436.9993
Attorneys for Fedder Plaintiffs

REBECCA HARRISON STEELE
ZEINA N. SALAM
ACLU Foundation of Florida, Inc.
West Central Florida Office
P.O. Box 18245
Tampa, FL 33679-8245
fax: 813.254.0926
Attorneys for Fedder Plaintiffs

HAYDEN R. DEMPSEY
GLENN T. BURHANS, JR.
Greenburg Traurig, PA
101 East College Avenue
Tallahassee, FL 32301
fax: 850.681.0207
Attorneys for Defendant, Vern Buchanan