

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

-----x  
NATIONAL ASSOCIATION FOR THE ADVANCEMENT  
OF COLORED PEOPLE STATE CONFERENCE OF  
PENNSYLVANIA (“NAACP-SCP”), et al.

CIVIL ACTION

Plaintiffs,

– against –

PEDRO A. CORTÉS, SECRETARY OF THE  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, et al.;

No. 08-5048

Defendants.  
-----x

**PLAINTIFFS’ MOTION FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION**

Plaintiffs, by their attorneys, hereby move for a permanent injunction, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 65, based on the evidence presented to the Court at an evidentiary hearing on October 28, 2008, and submit in support the Memorandum and Order of this Court of October 29, 2008.

This matter involves the provision of emergency paper ballots during elections in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.

Following the evidentiary hearing and extensive briefing on plaintiffs’ Motion for a Preliminary Injunction, this Court issued its Memorandum and Order setting forth detailed findings of facts and conclusions of law, including the following: (a) electronic voting machines undoubtedly fail and there is a real danger that a significant number will malfunction throughout the Commonwealth; (b) the delay in voting at a precinct where 50% or more of the voting machines are inoperable will unduly burden and thus deprive many citizens of their right to vote; (c) that injury, if it occurs, will be of the gravest magnitude and will give rise to a violation of at least the Equal Protection Clause of the Fourteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution; and (d) offering and making available paper ballots to voters when 50% of the

machines are inoperable at a polling place is necessary to protect their constitutional right to vote, and no state interest has been advanced to reject it.

In its Memorandum and Order of October 29, 2008, this Court accordingly found that plaintiffs were likely to succeed on the merits, would be irreparably harmed if the preliminary injunction was not granted, that the granting of injunctive relief would cause minimal harm to defendants, and that the granting of the injunction was in the public interest.

Based on the findings of facts and conclusions of law set forth in the Memorandum and Order of October 29, 2008, the Court issued an Order, *inter alia*, preliminarily enjoining the Secretary of the Commonwealth to direct all the County Boards of Elections throughout Pennsylvania as follows:

If 50% of electronic voting machines in a precinct are inoperable, “paper ballots, either printed or written and of any suitable form,” for registering votes (described herein as “emergency back-up paper ballots”) shall be distributed immediately to eligible voters pursuant to section 1120-A(b) of the Election Code. Emergency back-up paper ballots shall be used thereafter until the county board of elections is able to make the necessary repairs to the machine(s) or is able to place into operation a suitable substitute machine(s).

The evidence that was admitted at trial on the Motion for Preliminary Injunction would be admissible at trial, is part of the trial record, and need not be repeated here.

Counsel for defendants have advised counsel for plaintiffs that they do not intend to file a response in opposition to this motion.

WHEREFORE, plaintiffs request, pursuant to Rule 65(a) of the Fed. R. Civ. P., that the preliminary injunction issued on October 29, 2008, be entered as a permanent injunction, as set forth in the annexed Proposed Order.

Dated: Philadelphia, Pennsylvania  
\_January 23, 2009\_\_\_\_\_

PUBLIC INTEREST LAW CENTER  
OF PHILADELPHIA

125 South 9<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 700  
Philadelphia PA 19460  
(215) 627-7100

By: /s/ Michael Churchill

EMERY CELLI BRINCKERHOFF  
& ABADY LLP

Jonathan S. Abady\*\* (JA 5147)  
Andrew G. Celli, Jr.\*\* (AC 3598)  
Ilann Maazel\* (IM 5724)  
Eric Hecker\* (EH 0989)  
Elizabeth S. Saylor\* (ESS 8091)  
Elora Mukherjee\* (EM 0921)  
Kennisha Austin\* (KA 1269)

75 Rockefeller Plaza, 20<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, New York 10019  
(212) 763-5000

VOTER ACTION

John Bonifaz\*  
Legal Director (JB 0987)  
48 North Pleasant Street, Suite 304  
Amherst, Massachusetts 01002  
(413) 253-2700

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

\*Seeking admission *pro hac vice* in the Eastern District of Pennsylvania.

\*\* Admitted *pro hac vice* in the Eastern District of Pennsylvania.